Structured Academic Controversy

What kind of leader was Napoleon Bonaparte?

My partner & I believe Napoleon was a [leader] for the following 3 reasons:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reason</th>
<th>Source</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Napoleon was a [leader] because

The other partners on my team believe Napoleon was a [leader] for the following reason:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reason</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Consensus – argument that combines both perspectives (stated above)

Together, WE believe [reason]

because [reason]

because [reason]
On arriving in Nice (Italy), Napoleon wrote to the Directors (of the French Directory):

“One battalion has mutinied on the grounds that it has neither pay nor boots. I will restore order or I will give up this command.”

At the same time, he addressed the troops:

“Soldiers! You are hungry and badly clothed. The government owes you money, but can give you nothing. With me you will find honor, glory and riches.”

* battalion = a military unit, a large group of soldiers
* mutinied = rebelled against its officers
Napoleon's first wife, Joséphine de Beauharnais

Source 2

Napoleon's views on the role of women

Napoleon wrote the following lines in his journal while he was living in exile on the island of St. Helena, in 1817:

“In France, women are thought of too highly. They should not be regarded as equal to men. In reality, they are nothing more than machines for producing children. Society would become upset if women were allowed independence. To depend on men is their rightful position.”

Napoleon’s views on the education of females, in 1806:

“I do not think we need trouble ourselves with any plan of instruction for young females. They are not suited to being educated. They simply have to learn manners, because marriage is the only thing that matters.”
"Napoleon possessed the greatest personality of all time. He was superior to other men because of his intelligence, his speed of decision, his determination and his imagination."

O. Aubry, "Napoleon," 1964

"Napoleon was a military genius, but he was helped by improved weapons and by experienced soldiers. He was a master in moving huge bodies of men and equipment around Europe. These methods were the key to his successes."

A. Cobban, "A History of Modern France," 1965
Napoleon himself had no doubts about what had been achieved, as this comment written in December 1812 shows:

"It is said that I love power. Well, has anyone any reason to complain? Never have the prisons been so empty; the roads have never been safer. The government is strong, my hand is steady and the officials do their jobs properly. All citizens and all their properties are well-protected. I have governed for the people and their interests."
Napoleon's displays of courage inevitably led to foolish and rash encounters and lots of bloodshed.

A 1798 battle in Egypt showed how his creative thinking led to disastrous consequences. Napoleon organized his army into five gigantic squares during some battles to produce the effect of continual rolling fire (one group would fire, then the next rank/line would fire, and so on until the first group had reloaded and the process would start again). The French lost 30 men in one battle and their opposition five or six thousand. After this victory, however, he had arranged for no transportation home after his victory. He was left stranded with 35,000 soldiers. While waiting with his troops, his army was attacked by another enemy army in Egypt.

The victory was soured and after months of waiting for rescue, in 1799 Bonaparte abandoned his troops and secretly set sail for home.

* rash = impulsive, thoughtless
Source 6  
Napoleon's reforms

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Local government</th>
<th>Laws</th>
<th>Education</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The government of France was organized under a new <em>prefect</em> system. A <em>prefect</em> was a government official. One prefect was appointed to each of the 83 departments (regions) of France to run the area and make sure that the government's commands were obeyed.</td>
<td>Napoleon completely changed the legal system. Useless or out-of-date laws were thrown out and new laws were made simple and clear. This new system was called the <strong>Code Napoleon</strong>, and it was established in 1808. It ensured that many of the rights of a citizen gained during the Revolution were continued but only if Napoleon was King.</td>
<td>The education system was reorganized in France, giving more children an opportunity to learn. Napoleon set up state schools for some boys (no girls) called <em>lycées</em>, which were boarding schools and were not controlled by the Church. “Discipline and learning” were the main aims of these schools, because Napoleon needed soldiers and public servants. All teachers were to be properly trained and paid for by the state.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
During Napoleon’s rule, Napoleon attempted to conquer France’s surrounding territories. Napoleon won most of his battles on land, including the very important Battle of Austerlitz, which made most countries unable to defeat Napoleon’s army. In the water Battle of Trafalgar, however, the British fleet was able to destroy the French fleet and stop Napoleon’s navy from extending his conquest to more areas (like the Americas, Asia, etc).

*Use these maps to argue your perspective on Napoleon’s leadership*
Source 8

*Women and the Code Napoleon (Women's Treatment in the Law)*

"A husband owes protection to his wife, a wife must be obedient to her husband."

"Married women are not allowed to sign any contract of any sort."

"A wife may only sue for divorce if her husband's mistress actually lives in the family household."
Source 9

Napoleon's Military Victories in Portugal/Spain

Portugal kept trading with Spain, even though Napoleon had made it illegal for Europe to trade with Britain (their mortal enemy). Napoleon invaded Portugal and beat them within a year. Once Napoleon had control of Portugal, he had surrounded Spain. Even though Britain sent thousands of troops, Napoleon directed his troops to victories against the Spanish and the British. Though Napoleon defeated the Spanish and British military forces, the Spanish people launched a guerilla war, which after years of enduring many attacks made Napoleon decide to leave Spain and use his military forces elsewhere.
Source 10

From Napoleon's obituary

As a summary of life under Napoleon, this obituary appeared in a British newspaper shortly after his death:

“He got rid of liberty (freedom) in France. His subjects loved him because of his military glory. He produced more trouble and misery for his fellow human beings than anyone else of this age. His wars against foreign states were carried out to take the minds of his subjects off their slavery at home.”

London Times, 5 July 1821